

# **EXHIBIT A**

---

**From:** Paul Collins  
**Sent:** Friday, April 29, 2022 5:06 PM  
**To:** ART HILL  
**Cc:** Kadeisha West; Ashia Carpenter  
**Subject:** RE: Meet and Confer -- Hill v Carvana, LLC and Experian Information Solutions, Inc., Case No. 1:21-cv-00714  
**Attachments:** CRVNA00002-00003.pdf; 2022.4.29 Carvana's Suppl. Resp. to Hill's First RFP.pdf

Mr. Hill, attached please find Carvana's Supplemental Response to Plaintiff's RFP #2 along with CRVNA00002-00003. Please let us know if you have any questions.

Paul



---

PAUL T. COLLINS **PARTNER**  
paul.collins@nelsonmullins.com  
MERIDIAN | 17TH FLOOR  
1320 MAIN STREET | COLUMBIA, SC 29201  
T 803.255.9747 F 803.255.9128  
NELSONMULLINS.COM [VCARD](#) [VIEW BIO](#)

---

**From:** Paul Collins  
**Sent:** Wednesday, April 27, 2022 9:01 PM  
**To:** ART HILL <artbhill@hotmail.com>; Ashia Carpenter <ashia.carpenter@nelsonmullins.com>  
**Cc:** Kadeisha West <kadeisha.west@nelsonmullins.com>  
**Subject:** RE: Meet and Confer -- Hill v Carvana, LLC and Experian Information Solutions, Inc., Case No. 1:21-cv-00714

Mr. Hill, you may have received this already, but attached is the Stipulated Protective Order that was signed and filed by the Court yesterday. We will produce the portion of the Experian contract that we agreed to produce in our April 4 Meet and Confer Response Letter tomorrow or Friday.

Thank you,

Paul



---

PAUL T. COLLINS **PARTNER**  
paul.collins@nelsonmullins.com  
MERIDIAN | 17TH FLOOR  
1320 MAIN STREET | COLUMBIA, SC 29201

---

**From:** ART HILL <[artbhill@hotmail.com](mailto:artbhill@hotmail.com)>  
**Sent:** Monday, April 25, 2022 3:33 PM  
**To:** Ashia Carpenter <[ashia.carpenter@nelsonmullins.com](mailto:ashia.carpenter@nelsonmullins.com)>  
**Cc:** Paul Collins <[Paul.Collins@nelsonmullins.com](mailto:Paul.Collins@nelsonmullins.com)>; Kadeisha West <[kadeisha.west@nelsonmullins.com](mailto:kadeisha.west@nelsonmullins.com)>  
**Subject:** Re: Meet and Confer -- Hill v Carvana, LLC and Experian Information Solutions, Inc., Case No. 1:21-cv-00714

Sounds good.

Thanks

Art

Sent from my iPhone

On Apr 25, 2022, at 2:47 PM, Ashia Carpenter <[ashia.carpenter@nelsonmullins.com](mailto:ashia.carpenter@nelsonmullins.com)> wrote:

Thanks, Mr. Hill. Attached is the Joint Motion for Entry of Protective Order with your e-signature along with the Proposed Order (Exhibit A) which was previously provided to you via email on April 4, 2022. We intend to file today based on the consent you provided below.

Thanks,

Ashia

ASHIA CROOMS-CARPENTER  
[ashia.carpenter@nelsonmullins.com](mailto:ashia.carpenter@nelsonmullins.com)  
T 704.417.3235 F 704.377.4814

---

**From:** ART HILL <[artbhill@hotmail.com](mailto:artbhill@hotmail.com)>  
**Sent:** Saturday, April 23, 2022 5:24 AM  
**To:** Paul Collins <[Paul.Collins@nelsonmullins.com](mailto:Paul.Collins@nelsonmullins.com)>  
**Cc:** Ashia Carpenter <[ashia.carpenter@nelsonmullins.com](mailto:ashia.carpenter@nelsonmullins.com)>; Kadeisha West <[kadeisha.west@nelsonmullins.com](mailto:kadeisha.west@nelsonmullins.com)>  
**Subject:** RE: Meet and Confer -- Hill v Carvana, LLC and Experian Information Solutions, Inc., Case No. 1:21-cv-00714

I agree to the stipulated order for protection of documents. Accept this as my approval for you to apply my signature as /s/ Arthur Hill as well.

Thanks,

Art

---

**From:** Paul Collins <[Paul.Collins@nelsonmullins.com](mailto:Paul.Collins@nelsonmullins.com)>  
**Sent:** Monday, April 4, 2022 3:39 PM  
**To:** ART HILL <[artbhill@hotmail.com](mailto:artbhill@hotmail.com)>  
**Cc:** Ashia Carpenter <[ashia.carpenter@nelsonmullins.com](mailto:ashia.carpenter@nelsonmullins.com)>; Kadeisha West <[kadeisha.west@nelsonmullins.com](mailto:kadeisha.west@nelsonmullins.com)>  
**Subject:** Meet and Confer -- Hill v Carvana, LLC and Experian Information Solutions, Inc., Case No. 1:21-cv-00714

Mr. Hill, attached is Carvana's Response to your March 28, 2022 Meet and Confer Letter. Also attached is a proposed confidentiality order for this case for your review. If the confidentiality order is ok with you, we will file a joint motion requesting the Court to enter the order. Please let us know if you would like to schedule a call to discuss the proposed order or the Response.

Thank you,

Paul



---

PAUL T. COLLINS **PARTNER**  
[paul.collins@nelsonmullins.com](mailto:paul.collins@nelsonmullins.com)  
MERIDIAN | 17TH FLOOR  
1320 MAIN STREET | COLUMBIA, SC 29201  
T 803.255.9747 F 803.255.9128  
[NELSONMULLINS.COM](http://NELSONMULLINS.COM) [VCARD](#) [VIEW BIO](#)

---

**From:** ART HILL <[artbhill@hotmail.com](mailto:artbhill@hotmail.com)>  
**Sent:** Monday, March 28, 2022 2:16 AM  
**To:** Paul Collins <[Paul.Collins@nelsonmullins.com](mailto:Paul.Collins@nelsonmullins.com)>  
**Cc:** Ashia Carpenter <[ashia.carpenter@nelsonmullins.com](mailto:ashia.carpenter@nelsonmullins.com)>; Kadeisha West <[kadeisha.west@nelsonmullins.com](mailto:kadeisha.west@nelsonmullins.com)>  
**Subject:** RE: Meet and Confer -- Hill v Carvana, LLC and Experian Information Solutions, Inc., Case No. 1:21-cv-00714  
**Importance:** High

Attached are my issues with discovery from Carvana. Given the answer to RFP 1 alone and the lack of any supplements, I'm confident a motion to compel will be necessary....so I'll wait 7 days to file it...that's an additional 7 days on top of the pointless extension I had agreed to. Not really giving you attorneys more time to withhold, delay and obstruct.

Thanks,

Art

**Confidentiality Notice**

This message is intended exclusively for the individual or entity to which it is addressed. This communication may contain information that is proprietary, privileged, confidential or otherwise legally exempt from disclosure. If you are not the named addressee, you are not authorized to read, print, retain, copy or disseminate this message or any part of it. If you have received this message in error, please notify the sender immediately either by phone (800-237-2000) or reply to this e-mail and delete all copies of this message.